## ORIGINAL

ORANGE COUNTY INDUSTRIAL AGENCY
STATE OF NEW YORK

IN THE MATTER OF

CHURCH HILL PROPERTIES

11:00 a.m. Tuesday, July 10, 2018

Senior Center 15 Drew Avenue Highland Falls, New York

B E F O R E : KEVIN T. DOWD, ESQ.

46 Daisy Lane

Montgomery, New York 12549

KELLY REILLY, PROJECT MANAGER OCIDA

ALSO PRESENT:

JAMES DISALVO, BOARD MEMBER

REPORTED BY: ROBERTA O'ROURKE

FRANCES ROTH
COURT STENOGRAPHER

168 North Drury Lane, Newburgh, New York 12550
(845) 566-1641

Tuesday July 10th, 2018 at 11:00 a.m. local

and (iii) the acquisition in and around the

Improvements of certain items of machinery,

24

Dated June 22nd, 2018 by the Orange

County Industrial Development Agency.

24

MR. FLEISHER:

Thanks, Charles.

morning, thanks for coming out today.

I'm going to tell you a little bit about the hotel that we are contemplating. I apologize that I'm not able to project but perhaps we can just circulate this among you.

What we want to do is build a premium full service hotel and what that means is we are going to build a structure into the hill at 9W over Mearns Avenue.

The first level will be built into the side of the hill. You'll enter at the second level from the parking lot or from 9W and then there will be three levels above that. The ground level will be where we have all of the entertainment space, the banquet rooms, the wine cellar and the kitchen.

At the entry level or first level is where you would come in to the typical lobby reception, there we'll have the restaurant, two private dining rooms, two meeting rooms and a lounge.

We'll have a double height of 24-foot atrium as you enter. The entrance will be facing east so you'll get the Hudson Valley

25

professional and management positions and right around 90 of the staff that moves all the way from the room staff, restaurant staff

1.5

and bellhops associated with the premium
hotel.

What we are attempting to accomplish with this approach is to address what we believe are three underserved needs. One is there is no premium level hotel lodging in the Mid-Hudson Valley east of the Hudson or west of the Hudson. So there's a significant segment of the traveling community that is not being served. Despite the fact that this region is the third most visited destination in upstate New York.

The second opportunity is the fact that there is limited bed space to support the demand generated by the academy as well as today's brides who travel to this area, and we'd like to address that.

Finally, there's limited fine dining on the west side of the Hudson and we believe that the restaurant at the hotel will address that.

As such in addition to jobs we believe that the hotel will attract visitors to the area and it's our intention to present the

equivalent of about \$1.38 million, that's for

1	Church Hill Properties 10
2	the construction and the equipment and
3	fixtures. Mortgage recording tax of
4	\$325,500, and a 10 year pilot which would
5	have savings to the applicant of about
6	approximately \$3.986 million.
7	And with that information I will
8	gladly open to questions.
9	MS. MURPHY: My real name is Barbara
10	Murphy, Charlie.
11	Well, my first question was what is
12	the cost and you answered that with 39 and a
13	half million.
14	MR. FLEISHER: That's our current, our
15	current budget.
16	MS. MURPHY: When you were well,
17	and you don't have the financing in place at
18	this time?
19	MR. FLEISHER: We have two committed
20	lenders and we're closing the equity gap.
21	MS. MURPHY: Isn't the equity usually
22	easier than closing the other gap?
23	MR. FLEISHER: No, it really depends
24	on the project itself. In this case we've

got two lenders who are very interested in

1	Church Hill Properties 11
2	the project because of its nature and they
3	are looking to us to close the gap.
4	MS. MURPHY: But they won't sign until
5	you close that gap?
6	MR. FLEISHER: Yes. You're pushing
7	the string up the hill from both sides.
8	MS. MURPHY: This may be putting the
9	cart a little bit before the horse, but you
10	talked about all of the various needs and I
11	would agree with those. But within your
12	business plan what kind of money are you
13	dedicating to publicity and marketing?
14	MR. FLEISHER: Well over a million
15	five a year in the operating budget, as well
16	as an equivalent budget during the
17	pre-opening period.
18	MS. MURPHY: I'll let other people ask
19	questions.
20	MR. DOWD: I'm going to ask again all
21	members of the public at least address the
22	chair.
23	Really this public hearing is on the
24	IDA benefits. If you have some peripheral
25	questions I'm sure Ken will be happy to

1	2
_	_

## Church Hill Properties

answer them. But if you have any questions about what we are here for, which is the benefit of the package that the IDA is contemplating, that's really what we are here for today.

So Mr. D'Onofrio.

MR. D'ONOFRIO: Joe D'Onofrio.

Charlie touched on something I was going to bring up, so I guess I don't understand why the IDA is entertaining this when they don't have the financing. I, for a couple of years, literally maybe more than a couple of years, have been hearing about the financing not being available. It was said down in my office by them not long ago. There were other people in the room. So if they don't have the financing I'm not sure why we're contemplating this at the moment.

Number two, forgiving the sales tax you said it was over 1 million --

MR. DOWD: \$1.38 million.

MR. D'ONOFRIO: I would like, I don't know who these folks know, but I'm not sure if anyone else knows our situation here, and

## Church Hill Properties

2	I'm not going to go into the situation, when
3	I say situation here these folks know what
4	I'm talking about, okay, we're strapped,
5	okay? Other communities can make that claim
6	but you have to know us to know that that
7	really fits us.
8	I would like to see the sales tax
9	money, our portion that would go to the
10	county instead of it going to the county,
11	whatever our portion is, I would like that to
12	come here. I'm not asking for the million,
13	I'm asking for whatever share is ours IE
14	through the County's calculation that we
15	receive that sales tax.
16	MR. DOWD: Okay.
17	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Please consider that.
18	MR. DOWD: Okay.
19	MR. D'ONOFRIO: I'm just hearing for
20	the first time, maybe my fault, I'll address
21	this to you but that the bottom floor, first
22	floor is going to be built into the side of
23	the mountain, that's the first I'm hearing
24	that. So that raises questions that I'll

have to take care of after this meeting.

1	Church Hill Properties 14
2	MR. DOWD: Okay.
3	MR. D'ONOFRIO: I would like you to
4	explain to the folks because I had to have it
5	explained to me
6	MR. DOWD: Sure.
7	MR. D'ONOFRIO: forgiving the taxes
8	or whatever you call it.
9	MR. DOWD: Tax abatement.
10	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Tax abatement. What
11	it means not what it means, but we will
12	receive year one? It's a 10 year program?
13	MR. DOWD: Yes, 10 year program.
14	MR. D'ONOFRIO: So we will receive
15	year one what we are getting right now?
16	MR. DOWD: Right.
17	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Each year it goes up a
18	little?
19	MR. DOWD: Right, there's no
20	reduction. The land values are not taxed. I
21	mean whatever they're taxed at now they are
22	going to be taxed at going forward.
23	You're not going to lose any tax that
24	you presently get. It's only the abatement
25	is on the improvements to the property. So

1	Church Hill Properties 15
2	that's over a 10 year period that 10 percent
3	a year the taxes will rise till you get to
4	that final assessment number and that final
5	tax number.
6	So that's the incentive that we are
7	trying to, that we are offering, and we have
8	offered to other hotels in Orange County and
9	that they are asking us to consider as well.
10	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Just let me finish up.
11	And what is the projected savings to them
12	through the taxes?
13	MR. DOWD: For the pilot, 10 year
14	pilot, would be \$3.986 million.
15	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Almost \$4 million?
16	MR. DOWD: Right.
17	MR. D'ONOFRIO: So I relate that to
18	the sales tax, we should get our share of the
19	sales tax please.
20	MR. DOWD: Okay.
21	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Please consider that.
22	MR. DOWD: Okay.
23	Mr. DiSalvo?
24	MR. DiSALVO: I wanted to add to the
25	comment that that excludes sewer and water

Church Hill Properties 16
Charen hill flopereres
and fire district. No, they're not in the
fire district. And ambulance district.
MR. DOWD: Right, any special district
taxes are not involved with the pilot at all.
You get whatever your tax requirement is for
those districts.
Yes, sir.
MR. CALACICCO: Michael Calacicco.
This project still has to go through the
planning board, zoning board and other things
before it gets through that, I think, so that
addresses your issue.
MR. DOWD: I don't believe that's
correct, sir, I think they have all of their
land use approvals.
MR. FLEISHER: Yes.
MR. CALACICCO: Never mind.
MR. DOWD: Yes, sir.
MR. McCARTHY: Yes, Jack McCarthy, 55
Mearns Avenue. What will happen in two years
from now or three years from now and this
hotel doesn't make it with this tax, do they
still got to give it to us for the next 10

years?

1	Church Hill Properties 17
2	MR. DOWD: No. If the project fails
3	or they in any way default on our agreement
4	with them the pilot is canceled and it goes
5	on full assessment from that time on.
6	So, in other words, and we've had this
7	happen on other projects throughout the
8	county especially when bad economic times
9	hit, if we have to cancel because they aren't
10	paying the pilot on time or they're not
11	paying them at all, they fall behind in
12	taxes, they get into foreclosure proceedings
13	with their banks, we have the right to cancel
14	the agreements and put it back on the tax
15	roles.
16	MR. DiSALVO: Full.
17	MR. DOWD: Full assessed value.
18	MR. McCARTHY: Okay, thank you.
19	MR. D'ONOFRIO: I'm sorry, so two
20	years in it's still being built, whatever,
21	but it folds, you as you're the lease
22	owner
23	MR. DOWD: Yes, they lease the

property to us and we lease it back to them as our agent.

1	Church Hill Properties 18
2	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Whose responsibility
3	is this empty shell up there if it happens?
4	MR. DOWD: The developer has all
5	responsibilities, the IDA does not have the
6	responsibility. And those agreements
7	indemnify and hold harmless the IDA and they
8	have full responsibility to do whatever has
9	to be done with that site.
10	MR. D'ONOFRIO: So I still think, it's
11	a repeat, I still think we are putting the
12	cart before the horse when we are
13	entertaining this with no financing.
14	MR. DOWD: Well, the IDA will not
15	close necessarily on the benefits until we
16	are told and they show us they have the
17	financing.
18	MR. DiSALVO: They will show it.
19	MR. DOWD: Yes.
20	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Will you share that?
21	MR. DOWD: We have no problem doing
22	that, no. Once they give it to us it's a
23	public document under FOIL, we have no
24	problem with doing that.
25	Yes, ma'am.

MS. MURPHY: Charlie Murphy again. did have a previous owner of this project go to the IDA for an agreement, that agreement ended up being extended to 11 years I believe, nothing ever happened. There were a couple what I would call disingenuous representations by the previous owners to the village board.

Is it possible within the new agreement going forward to make it date specific? If they are going to be open in 2020 can the tax abatement start in 1919 when they are under development and irrespective of where they are in five years, if they're not completed, the clock is still ticking? I don't want to see another six year hiatus.

MR. DOWD: Right, okay, so first of all let's talk about the previous application. The IDA after about I think it was about four or five years where there was back and forth and everything was sort of changing about the project and about the financing, about everything, we canceled and annulled that, any approvals of that first

agreement. This is now a reapplication, its new partners, some new partners involved, so we are looking at this fresh again.

Almost every project is going to have a construction period and in that construction period you still abate the taxes because you don't want them to basically start the process of almost overtaxing before the project is even up and running, it would be defeating the purpose of it.

But the agreement does not get extended unless the IDA extends the agreement.

So, for instance, again you are talking about they get two years into the construction and they have problems with the bank and everything stops, then everything is going to stop from the IDA's point of view as well.

We have an obligation to protect the coffers of our ultimate beneficiaries, the town and county tax papers. We also have our own guidance by the authority budget office and state comptroller and we've been very

diligent now in trying to make sure that we
do not let projects extend unnecessarily
long, that we make sure and we are trying to
make even better care that all of the taxes,
all of the pilot payments are made on time.
We have canceled several projects and the
pilots because of the untimeliness and other
things like that. So we do monitor this
project all through the process.

MS. MURPHY: So to clarify if, for instance, in 2021 the project is three quarters built but doesn't go forward the value of the project in the fourth year will be assessed at full value?

MR. DOWD: If the IDA decides that the project is not doing what it was intended to do and the benefits are not going to be reaped by the project failing we will cancel everything. And whatever improvements are on that land will be the subject to full taxation by the assessors of Highland Falls and Town of Highland.

MR. LOUCKS: I am Greg Loucks, may I address Charlie's question?

by a civil engineer.

2.4

25

We are coming down the hill, we are

2.0

diverting storm water running them into new
catch basins, going all the way down towards
Roe Park essentially with a new storm water
management system. So that will be in
addition to a bond there will be a cash
value, letter of credit that establishes and
protects the village's interests for the cost

of that off-site work.

So in the event -- in fact the developers' agreement only allows -- does not allow us rather to start any on-site work until the off-site improvements have been completed, inspected and accepted by the village.

The other part of the letter of credit is for on-site improvements. Because there's so much water that comes off that ridge in the mountain up on the side it's coming onto that site, so we essentially have a very expensive retention system. There's no retention ponds.

If you would go to a typical construction site you'll see big ponds everywhere, as all the storm water off of

1	Church Hill Properties 24
2	impervious surfaces will be bringing directly
3	into there.
4	In this case we are doing subterranean
5	underneath the parking lot for the most part,
6	baffled systems of reservoirs that slow the
7	water down, retain the water in accordance
8	with 100 year storm data, so on and so forth,
9	and eventually moves it down to Roe Park
10	where it's distributed.
11	Does that help answer the question?
12	To the bond it is a fully bonded job
13	and our project budget entertains and
14	provides for the cost of the bond.
15	MR. McCARTHY: Those filters
16	MR. DOWD: Sir, excuse me, please, she
17	takes everything down. Can I have your name
18	again please?
19	MR. McCARTHY: John McCarthy on Mearns
20	Avenue, I live right below that.
21	They have to be maintained. What
22	she's saying is what happens if this falls
23	through, I mean how is it going to be
24	maintained if there's nobody up there?

MR. LOUCKS: I mean I think that's a

3 4

5

6 7

8

9

11

10

12

13

14 1.5

16

18

17

19

21

20

22

23

24

25

good question frankly. In the event that the hotel will get built, get your financing, the hotel is going to get built. We've done an analysis, a market analysis, to make sure the market will support this, right? If not you wouldn't have entertained building this building in the first place.

Sir, it's a good question what happens if everything just falls apart. You got this big building, you have a system that's being retained, how long will it take for it to fall apart? I don't know the answer to that. I can talk to our civil engineer. Cartolsi (phonetic spelling), he could probably tell you as much as anything else. It's a very simple baffled system. The only problem you will probably hear about will be sediment getting in there and maybe blocking one of your outlets. I don't think that would happen, you could probably run it for 15 years before anything like that would happen.

MR. McCARTHY: It's something that has to be maintained, I know about them, you

1	Church Hill Properties 26
2	know.
3	MR. LOUCKS: I agree, sir.
4	MR. FLEISHER: Can I make a comment?
5	MR. DOWD: Sure.
6	MR. FLEISHER: In the event that the
7	project halts we have put up a million
8	dollars standby letter of credit that the
9	town can call on immediately upon that
10	default to do whatever work needs to be done
11	to mitigate whatever situation they have.
12	MR. D'ONOFRIO: I want to correct
13	that, the village.
14	MR. DOWD: Wait, Mr. Mayor, please
15	wait a minute.
16	MR. D'ONOFRIO: That's inaccurate.
17	MR. DOWD: She's typing.
18	MR. FLEISHER: It is inaccurate, I
19	said the wrong thing, the letter of credit is
20	to the benefit of the Village of Highland
21	Falls.
22	MR. DOWD: Yes, sir?
23	MR. SMITH: My name is Frank Smith.
24	My question has to do with the manpower. I'm

excited by the idea of having 115 to 120 jobs

in this little village, it will have a huge impact. How do you assure over that 10 year period that we get the jobs that are being promised now?

MR. DOWD: Well, again every year we send out an audit letter, because we have to do it for the state, asking every project that we have to give us the information and to verify the employment numbers.

So, in other words, if they get sales tax exemption they have to report to the state how many employees they have, how many employees they pay workers' comp for and disability for and payroll stuff. We get copies or verification so we can verify whether or not they are producing the numbers that they promised us for the benefits we gave them.

If they are not, we have the right to callback or to recapture any and all of the benefits if we feel that the project is not proving to be what they said it's going to be.

MR. SMITH: So there will be fallback

1	Church Hill Properties 28
2	if they do not maintain the manpower on a
3	timeline?
4	MR. DOWD: It's at the discretion of
5	the IDA board.
6	MR. SMITH: We'd like to recommend
7	that.
8	MR. DOWD: Okay, your comments are
9	received.
10	Mr. DiSalvo?
11	MR. DiSALVO: Quick question, do we
12	have an idea of what the figure of the bond
13	would be?
14	MR. DOWD: Which?
15	MR. DiSALVO: The surety bond.
16	MR. DOWD: To us, to the IDA?
17	MR. DiSALVO: The amount? It's not ar
18	IDA question. I can ask that question at a
19	later time, I figured I would just get it out
20	of the way now.
21	MR. LOUCKS: I can answer that
22	question.
23	So the project budget, when Ken used
24	the term or the figure 39.5 million, that's a

total project budget. It includes what we

1	Church Hill Properties 29	
2	call hard and soft costs.	
3	Soft costs being marketing, being	
4	taxes, being interest payments to the bank.	
5	And, by the way, any lender is going to	
6	require us to fully bond this because they	
7	also want to protect their asset, the ones	
8	who have loaned the money. It's a very	
9	important point.	
_0	So the hard cost is the cost of	
_1	construction itself. That cost is about,	
.2	right now, about 28 to \$30 million to build	
13	the building itself, construction cost.	
4	Therefore, the bond that we will put up will	1
15	be to cover that cost of construction.	
16	MR. DiSALVO: Okay.	
L7	MR. LOUCKS: So about a 28 to 30	
L8	million-dollar bond.	
L9	MR. DiSALVO: And just because it's	
20	based on the figures and the taxation at one	е
21	point the project was a 20 million-dollar	
22	project to build the hotel up there, going	
23	back several years from the initial	

application, so we are at 30 for hard cost to

build the hotel now?

1	Church Hill Properties 30
2	MR. LOUCKS: About that.
3	MR. DiSALVO: About that?
4	MR. LOUCKS: Yes.
5	MR. DiSALVO: Okay.
6	MR. DOWD: Yes, ma'am.
7	MS. MENNITE: Hi, I'm Barbara Mennite,
8	11 Locust Street, a resident in the village
9	and I'm also the secretary to the Chamber of
10	Commerce. I'm speaking as a resident right
11	now. I have comments and some questions.
12	First of all I'm speaking as a
13	resident, I don't want any extra tax burden
14	put on me as a result of the project.
15	As the mayor mentioned without details
16	about 94 percent of the land of the Town of
17	Highlands is under federal use for West
18	Point, that straps the people of this
19	community.
20	So you had mentioned that they will be
21	paying property tax including going into
22	school taxes because as a resident it's hard
23	for me when I get a notice that it says oh,
24	well your property taxes are only going up

\$108 this year, your school taxes are only

1	Church Hill Properties 31
2	going up \$169.
3	Now, if you can clarify what I thought
4	I heard you say is that the project will be
5	paying property tax but not an increased
6	value over this period of time. So in the
7	meantime those of us who live here will be
8	picking up the tab of whatever increase costs
9	and value.
10	MR. DOWD: Let's get this straight,
11	they will not pay any less taxes than they
12	are presently paying now today. It will not
13	change any of that tax structure.
14	So if they are paying \$50,000 in land
15	taxes right now they are going to pay \$50,000
16	a year in land taxes as the project is built.
17	That's not going to change.
18	MS. MENNITE: Mine can increase.
19	MR. DOWD: Why would yours increase if
20	they are paying the same amount?
21	MS. MENNITE: Ours will increase,
22	their's won't increase.
23	MR. DOWD: They will continue to pay
24	whatever special district taxes, they will

still pay the full tax that they have to pay

	32	
pay		
r		
have	e to	
s?		

## Church Hill Properties

that they are paying now. They will under the fire district taxes or water district, sewer district taxes, they pay all of those.

MS. MENNITE: On a yearly basi

MR. DOWD: Every year, just like they are doing. It's not affected at all by the tax abatement.

MS. MENNITE: Okay. Then also -- well that's good.

Well just the point I was concerned about is that we have to be very judicious on what comes off the tax roll or what reduces tax income here. We need waterfront property for development of waterfront access here. We need places for recreation to encourage families to come here and live. So we can't just, you know, oh this gets a tax, you know, this gets benefits, this gets benefits.

And also I understand that you were doing a study regarding how West Point and the community can have better relationships through --

MR. DOWD: The IDA was doing a study?

14

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

16 17

15

18

19

20 2.1

22

23

24

1	Church Hill Properties 33
2	No, I don't think that's correct.
3	MS. MENNITE: Patterns For Progress.
4	MR. DOWD: We are not Patterns For
5	Progress, ma'am.
6	MS. MENNITE: Well, that I do know.
7	But I thought there was a study. I was
8	interviewed for a study.
9	MR. DOWD: Well, I believe that
10	members of the IDA staff, who were doing what
11	they call a SWOT analysis with the village to
12	find out what perhaps the IDA's Accelerator
13	Program can do to try to bring businesses in
14	I think they were talking about maybe
15	using an old school up here. That analysis
16	was being done with the cooperation of the
17	IDA and the village and I think the town.
18	MS. MENNITE: Yes, I was interviewed
19	actually and my point with this is this, tha
20	if the old guard is asking for special
21	consideration I think there should be
22	guarantees for the community.
23	In other words, it's going to bring
24	these jobs, how many of them are going to be

hired from the village and from Fort

_

4

Montgomery? Could money be specifically required for marketing and advertising in the village and Fort Montgomery?

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

The material I've seen, I've gone to some of the planning board meetings and the government meetings where this has been discussed, and the literature really presents it as a straight shot from 9W to Stoney Lonesome Gate and how wonderful it makes West Point. It's going to be in our community and as a resident I really don't want it to just

be a private adjunct of West Point.

11 12

14

15 16

17

18

20

19

21

22

23

24

25

For example, we had a business open a couple of years ago, they bought the building

I think it's very fair that local dollars be committed to the community. That as a member of the Chamber of Commerce, you know, I don't know how much of that can actually go into your consideration but I think as far as any resident of Orange County goes they should have some guaranty that it's going to contribute to the sustainability to our local communities and that includes helping people live here.

Church	Hill	Proper	ties
--------	------	--------	------

1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
7			
8			
9			

2.4

and they had to spend, I don't know the exact number, but probably twice the amount they had budgeted to get that building under code and up and running and they're still struggling. They didn't get any benefits.

There was another business that wanted to open and they had similar problems, they didn't get any of these types of benefits.

So I think the overall impact in the community needs to be looked at.

MR. DOWD: Let me see if I can try to address some of your issues. The IDA does have a local labor policy as far as construction jobs are concerned. We require that all projects have 85 percent local labor. Local labor is really a six or seven county area because obviously sometimes we can't get all the labor we want from our specific local economy. We do enforce that. We do have monitors of that. And so that's something we have been doing since 2014 on every project that came in after 2014.

My understanding from the application, and we can have Ken clarify this, that of the

115 to 120 full time employees that other than about two or three I think it is I think in your application they all will be local.

Now, you define local, I can ask Ken to probably address that, we do not in our individual agreements with developers and our tax agreement and the like, tie them to tell them how they have to hire, that would be beyond our authority to do. Obviously, we encourage local labor every step of the way.

That's one reason why the IDA through its Accelerator Program reached out and worked with Highland Falls and tried to work with Highland Falls to help existing businesses get a helping hand trying to use vacant space in the village to find out what a good use for it would be.

I think we were talking about the school that was basically empty, trying to find maybe using a commercial kitchen operation there or some other thing where we could help the community, all of our communities.

We now have our third Accelerator

2.1

Program, we just opened one in the City of

Newburgh, we're going to be opening one in

the City of Newburgh next week, one in

Middletown in the old Horton Hospital and we

6 have one in New Windsor.

We are trying to take empty space, bring in small start-up companies and help them develop, hire people, move out of the Accelerator, rent space in Orange County that's vacant and continue that process. So we are looking at other SWOTs in Warwick and other places around the county that are all looking for help from our Accelerator Program.

So highland Falls is certainly on that list. I know they were working and obviously you were interviewed by our staff members, our managing director and chief operating officer, they sat down with you folks. So we have a lot of components.

We understand why give the new guy the breaks, the old guy doesn't get any breaks, that's what the Accelerator Program is partially trying to do, it's trying to get

breaks and help out the existing businesses.

We have an Accelerator Without Walls
Project, it's perfect for all of the existing
businesses. If they have some problems with
engineering, we get them engineering advice
free of charge to try to help them develop
and get passed their problems.

So we're very cognizant of that. And the IDA board has been working really to change the whole direction of the Accelerator probably three years ago. We hear you and the IDA board hears you.

MS. MENNITE: I want to follow-up again on the special nature. My concerns with the economics of this type of agreement in our special case is that people could go to that place, the old guard and then buy things there and then go to West Point which has its own economy. You can shop there, you can visit there without paying any sales tax, without contributing anything to the Orange County or local government and then leave.

So my concern is constructing this in some way where financially, I mean benefiting

1	Church Hill Properties 39
2	West Point I guess in a bigger picture
3	benefits Orange County. But due to the
4	special nature of the way you can just visit
5	there, leave and just be a very insularly
6	thing unto itself needs to be considered.
7	MR. DOWD: Ken, do you want to say
8	something quickly and then I will take this
9	gentleman why don't I take this
10	gentleman's question first.
11	MR. KOPALD: Ned Kopald. I'm speaking
12	as a representative of the Highland Falls
13	School Board and myself personally.
14	Do you have the current assessed value
15	on the property?
16	MR. FLEISHER: About \$700,000.
17	MR. KOPALD: Pardon me?
18	MR. FLEISHER: About \$700,000.
19	MR. KOPALD: What was it before it was
20	purchased by the entity that purchased it?
21	MR. FLEISHER: I don't know.
22	MR. KOPALD: I would like to see it
23	documented because I think the 700,000 is not
24	what it was at the time it was owned as a

previous motel.

1	Church Hill Properties 40
2	If in fact it has been increased that
3	is good to recognize the value paid for it
4	and not the value as the Pointer's Echo
5	Motel.
6	MR. DOWD: I believe the current land
7	value, based upon the information we got from
8	the county, is \$279,000.
9	MR. KOPALD: I'm sorry?
10	MR. DOWD: 279,000 is the current land
11	assessment.
12	MR. FRANKEL: Assessed value or full
13	market?
14	MR. DOWD: It says land assessment, so
15	it's not full.
16	MR. FRANKEL: I don't know, are they
17	100 percent?
18	MR. DiSALVO: 106.
19	MR. KOPALD: I think that is the total
20	assessment.
21	MR. DiSALVO: Is it two properties?
22	MR. FLEISHER: Yes.
23	MR. DiSALVO: Two separate parcels?
24	MR. LOUCKS: Yes.
25	MR. KOPALD: That I believe would

1	Church Hill Properties 41
2	represent the original Pointer's Echo Motel.
3	MR. FLEISHER: And Lilos parcel as
4	well.
5	MR. KOPALD: Is the proposed abatement
6	plan different in any way from the accepted
7	abatement plan that was previously granted by
8	the IDA?
9	MR. DOWD: No, it's still a 10 year
10	pilot. It's still recording tax and still
11	sales tax exemption. The sales tax went up
12	because the project cost went up.
13	MR. KOPALD: Understandable.
14	MR. DOWD: But not on the pilot. The
15	pilot is still considered 10 year assessment,
16	10 year pilot.
17	MR. KOPALD: I would re-echo what the
18	mayor of the village, Mr. D'Onofrio
19	indicated, that it would seem fair and I
20	would request the developers to support the
21	concept that the village's share that they
22	would have gotten if the project paid sales
23	tax to the county be considered so that the
24	village, who is dependent upon sales tax to a

significant extent, would gain to benefit.

I would ask the IDA to consider that the abatement plan not be over a 10 year period, that's in my opinion too beneficial to the project. Certainly the project if it's going to be successful would be successful before nine or 10 years.

The amount of school tax that would be abated is tremendous. I believe the figures you gave which would include county, town and school, approximately 3.896 million in real property tax, that's independent of the mortgage tax abatement and the sales tax.

The school and the community, as the other speakers have mentioned, is in a unique situation, unique not only to the County of Orange but probably to the United States in that approximately 96 percent of the land is not taxable either as a result of the federal government taking or New York State. We are on a fringe of losing properties, people moving out.

And as Barbara had mentioned to a homeowner who has already reached the pivotal point of too much taxes when we increase it

by only \$150 it's already gone passed the place of no return for many people. We have a very substantial number unfortunately of homes in foreclosure. And I would ask that both the IDA and the project will consider that the abatement period be less than the

full 10 years.

I will ask the town to check on its current assessed value. If the assessed value for the original piece of property of the Pointer's Echo Hotel remains at the same amount as it was when it was owned by the previous owner it seems to me that there has been a failure to address the issue that this property has substantially increased in value, confirmed by the amount of money that the new owners purchased it for.

So I would ask that before the IDA were to grant the abatement that they ascertain those factual pieces of information because it would impact the formula for the abatement over the 10 year period.

I would ask also, gentlemen, who is going to own the storm water infrastructure

2	

4

that comes down from the site down Berry's
Hill into the Roe Park area and onto Fickens
Field and across Fickens Field which Fickens
Field is owned by the school district?

5

MR. LOUCKS: I can answer that

7

question.

8

MR. DOWD: Sure.

MR. LOUCKS:

9

will own it, however during installation it's

11

10

an engineered system, of course by a civil

12

engineer with a license to practice. It has

The village of course

13

been accepted by the village. In fact, the

14

design is in collaboration with the village.

15

We must install it properly. We will have a

16

third-party licensed inspector to ensure

17

that, for example, that the right materials

18

are used, the right sized pipes are used, the

19

right boxes are installed, the elevations are

20

proper, that compaction is proper.

21

The village itself will also have its

2223

own inspector to ensure that everything is

24

we will be responsible because we will

being done right so it works properly.

25

warrant it, the product. And I think the

45
•
are
t's
r
ssue
ost,
to
er
if
, m <u>y</u>
m
eir
gn

MR. DOWD: I just want to make sure

everybody understand even if the IDA did not

consider a 10 year pilot they are entitled under New York State law under 45B to actually get a 10 year, if you want it call pilot, it would be about half the amount of the abatement on new construction under New York State law.

So basically instead of 10 percent a year it would be 5 percent a year for 10 years. This is our enhanced pilot agreement which is 10 percent after 10 years. So they are entitled to a break under New York State law, so.

MR. KOPALD: I would just indicate that I believe if properly instructed that this would be a benefit to the community and I'm supportive in that respect, but the project I don't expect that they would do it, but the project owners could agree to take less of the 10 year than they may be entitled to in recognition of being a good partner and steward for the community. Thank you.

MS. LAWLESS: My name is Ann Lawless from the school board. So years ago when this first came up, when we talked about

Church Hill	Properties
-------------	------------

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	

this, we saw many different options were given to us when we were sitting in the library for hours at a time trying to work out some sort of agreement. I think you guys were involved in that. There was a sliding scale and there were adjustments that the previous applicant agreed to.

It kind of goes to what Ned is saying about they were willing from a school tax and I believe from the village tax as well to make some adjustments in the percentages based on the year.

Is there a sliding scale or are there actual numbers determined now that would show what's been agreed upon, what the application is?

MR. DOWD: Nothing has been agreed upon yet. The IDA is going to take the minutes of this hearing, as well as their application, and ultimately make a decision on what kind of benefits they want to award to this project.

MS. LAWLESS: By the year. Because I know that the way it was explained to us the

last time, and I know it was many years ago and things have changed, but how it was explained to us is whatever the normal scale was over the years, one year, you know, year one it's your regular taxes, year two you pay this percent, three, four, up to year 10.

There was at that point a negotiation that was allowed to say, you know, bump it up a little bit in year two, bump it up more in three. So I don't know if that's still an option but it's something that I would like. I need to be able to go back to my board and say no that's off the table.

MR. DOWD: I don't recall what you're speaking about right now, ma'am.

MS. LAWLESS: I was sitting there in the library for many hours at different --

MR. DOWD: I'm not saying it can't be done, but right now we have the application before us which is asking for a specific 10 year enhanced pilot.

MS. LAWLESS: My question is when will we have those numbers to take forward to our constituents to say year one? I need to know

what it's going to be for the school.

MR. DOWD: Well, the school district as a taxing entity becomes not a party to our agreement but they get notice of everything. In other words, they are going to get, if you have to administer a pilot agreement you need to see the pilot agreement and the agreement because you want to send out the payment in lieu of taxes every year.

MS. LAWLESS: I am not passing judgment but what happened with this is we just got the notice of this meeting last week, people are on vacation, people -- so it's very difficult, we can't have this thrown at us, we need to get it.

MR. DOWD: So the process would be now the hearing will be done today, the board gets it, the board could take this up at its August board meeting at which point they would award whatever benefits they want to award. And then we need to close with the applicant, the IDA, our bond counsel, our transactional counsel and their counsel to close which might take us into September.

1	Church Hill Properties 50
2	And I know you folks want to start building I
3	think sometime in the fall, so that's
4	probably the timeline right now.
5	MS. LAWLESS: Then we go back to
6	MR. DOWD: Once that agreement is
7	signed between the parties all of the taxing
8	entities have to have a copy of it because
9	they are going to have to administer it.
10	MR. KOPALD: It's after the fact.
11	MS. LAWLESS: It's after the fact.
12	MR. KOPALD: We need to have input
13	MR. DOWD: This is your input.
14	MR. KOPALD: before the final
15	decision.
16	MR. DOWD: This is your input.
17	MS. LAWLESS: Okay, let me go back to
18	what these guys are saying early on, how
19	could you even consider this at an August
20	meeting when their funding hasn't been
21	MR. DOWD: Again, it could be done in
22	August, it could be done in September, we
23	don't know exactly when they are getting the
24	financing. We are told it's going to be in

place, but if it's not in place we won't do

1	Church Hill Properties 51
2	the final resolution.
3	One of the things we can do is we go
4	to the County Real Property Office and they
5	give us basically a model for the 10 year
6	pilot and all the taxes are going to be paid
7	to the different entities, we can probably
8	get that to you.
9	MS. LAWLESS: That's what we worked
10	off the last time.
11	MR. DOWD: The village, the school
12	district.
13	MS. LAWLESS: That would be great,
14	that would be a huge help. That's what we
15	worked off of the last time.
16	MR. DOWD: If you leave your name with
17	Kelly we'll see that you get that.
18	MS. LAWLESS: Thank you.
19	MR. KOPALD: That was given I'm
20	sorry, that was given to us last time in
21	advance.
22	MR. DOWD: Ned, we have no problem
23	giving it to you. As I said if you leave
24	your information I'll have Kelly get that

information to you by e-mail and you'll have

1	Church Hill Properties 52
2	it and we'll send it to the mayor and to the
3	town, the supervisor. If they want it, we
4	can give it to you.
5	MS. LAWLESS: Thank you.
6	MR. KOPALD: I would ask that the IDA
7	not close the hearing until the
8	municipalities receive that. The
9	municipalities should have the opportunity to
10	at least submit something in writing for the
11	consideration of the IDA. This shouldn't be
12	blind man's bluff.
13	MR. DOWD: Comment noted, Mr. Kopald.
14	And we'll decide I'll decide whether we
15	are going to close this or not after I hear
16	the rest of the comments, okay?
17	There's someone else that wants to
18	speak. We'll get you in a second, I will get
19	right back to you.
20	MR. KOPALD: As I asked, which was
21	obviously given no consideration, the setting
22	up of the meeting at 11 o'clock on a Tuesday
23	is significantly unfair to the communities
24	and the people that we serve. Most of the

people in this community work. If it was in

Church Hill Properties 53
the evening, as we had requested previously,
you would have significantly more persons of
interest, I believe, present. And I think
it's extremely unfair and of course how many
members are there in the IDA?
MR. DOWD: Seven, seven board members.
MR. KOPALD: And we have two or three
here.
MR. DOWD: We have one, Mr. DiSalvo.
MR. DiSALVO: I'm on the school board.
MR. DOWD: I'm counsel, she's staff
but that's why we record this so every board
member will read, and they do read the
minutes of this hearing, before they decide
on anything.
MR. KOPALD: I don't know how the IDA
can continue to function with the power that
it has when the persons who are going to be
making a decision, absent Mr. DiSalvo, are
not interested enough to even be physically
present.
You say they will have the opportunity

to read the minutes, but the IDA in my

opinion while having some positive effects

1	Church Hill Properties 54
2	and it has been helpful in the school's
3	interest in the Accelerator, etc, is an
4	agency with tremendous power to the negative
5	of communities and local control.
6	We're charged, the town, the village,
7	the school, with coming up with a tax burden.
8	Yet our tax ability is significantly affected
9	by IDA abatements that negate home rule
10	essentially in totality. I feel it's
11	important to put that on the record.
12	MR. DOWD: You are on the record, Mr.
13	Kopald.
14	Yes, ma'am.
15	MS. MURPHY: By necessity Trustee
16	Murphy. By necessity we're getting deep into
17	the weeds in order to protect the interests
18	of our taxpayers. I do think that virtually
19	everyone in this room is supportive of the
20	project, we want to see that hotel built.
21	But you had mentioned a couple things that
22	the abatements do not address. And I wanted
23	to check, will they still pay the hotel tax
24	or is that included

MR. DOWD: No. You mean the room tax

1	Church Hill Properties 55
2	that the county levies? Yes.
3	MS. MURPHY: They are not going to
4	pay
5	MR. DiSALVO: They will pay it.
6	MS. MURPHY: They will pay it?
7	MR. DOWD: Yes, it will not be
8	affected by our agreement. In other words,
9	we can abate real property taxes, not any
10	other kind of tax. Sales tax, yes, but not
11	hotel taxes, no.
12	MS. MURPHY: And you also mentioned
13	taxes, well fire district taxes. We
14	currently have in the village an all
15	volunteer fire department. The previous
16	managing person had accused me of trying to
17	extort a fire truck out of this project. And
18	I believe someone in the group said we don't
19	need a ladder truck we'll use West Point's.
20	Now, recently there has been talk that
21	West Point is not going to have their ladder
22	truck. If you're building a structure that's
23	in excess of 35 feet tall can it be written
24	into the agreement that in exchange for this

tax abatement they will provide firematic

1	Church Hill Properties 56
2	equipment?
3	MR. DOWD: We do not do that, ma'am.
4	MS. MURPHY: So we would have to form
5	a fire district in order to try to recoup
6	some of it?
7	MR. DOWD: Well, again, I'm not going
8	to try to explain to the village or the town
9	how they can handle the issue. But, no, we
10	do not abate fire district taxes, special
11	district taxes. If this tax is part of the
12	village tax with the village fire department,
13	that's part of the abatement process.
14	But we do not and we cannot negotiate
15	a deal where we're basically saying to the
16	applicant you can have the tax abatement but
17	you have to buy the village a fire truck,
18	that is not in our jurisdiction.
19	MS. MURPHY: It would be needed only
20	for their property.
21	MR. DOWD: Again, I have to say I'm
22	sure that it's part of the site plan approval
23	process and the SEQR process they had to look

at firematics and how a fire at that location

would be handled. That would have been part,

24

1	Church Hill Properties 57
2	I believe, of the whole review process, the
3	site plan and the environmental, so.
4	MS. MURPHY: Was it dependent on West
5	Point?
6	MR. LOUCKS: It was addressed very
7	specifically with the chief obviously who
8	looked at it and required the fire path
9	around. We looked at the front of the
10	building.
11	Charlie, I don't recall specifically
12	but it may have been that, so I don't want to
13	speak out of turn, I do think he said
14	something about West Point's fire truck could
15	respond as a ladder truck.
16	MS. MURPHY: As long as they continue
17	to have them.
18	MR. LOUCKS: There's a separate point
19	that I can address later, probably outside
20	this meeting, in terms of what is built into
21	the mountainside, it's not per se, so I want
22	to explain that. But it also provides, it's
23	kind of like the hotel is right now, you can
24	drive around to the back and the back is

below grade. We're doing essentially the

## Church Hill Properties

2	same thing to reduce mass per the village's
3	request. It also enables us to be below that
4	point in the front so we can access.

When the chairman allows I will also address the point of timing why now. Would you like me to?

The question about timing, which are good questions, why are you addressing this now? Because there is a project budget obviously. He has to go out and get financing. And any entitlements that may be granted, may not be, from the IDA are a component of the project budget, which has a pretty big bearing on how much he has to get from either investors or lenders, the bank in this case here. And so this is going to inform our project budget, inform their financing strategy.

So knowing right now what they may or may not get from the IDA, how it affects our actual construction cost, is really critical to us to go out and finalize financing in the street.

MR. DOWD: Are there any other

1	Church Hill Properties 59
2	questions on the IDA benefits?
3	Mr. Mayor.
4	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Here is a, so the
5	county gets its hotel tax?
6	MR. DOWD: Yes.
7	MR. D'ONOFRIO: We would like to have
8	our sales tax. I mean that's fair. The
9	county is going to get their hotel tax, God
10	bless them. You know our, you know, our
11	issues here.
12	MR. LOUCKS: Yes, sir.
13	MR. D'ONOFRIO: Please consider, I
14	would ask the IDA and you guys to consider
15	our portion of what the sales tax would be,
16	please.
17	MR. DOWD: Okay.
18	MR. LOUCKS: Is there a way to
19	understand that?
20	MR. DOWD: We'll talk about that.
21	Yes, ma'am.
22	MS. MENNITE: Barbara Mennite again.
23	I would like to make an amendment of
24	information. First of all I appreciate
25	Attorney Kopald's words.

3

4

5

6

7

8 9

1.0

11

12

14

13

15

16

18

17

19

20

21

22

23

24 25

I would like for whatever agreement is made to be made with them acting as a steward coming into this community and to cooperate, to benefit the community and not be another stress as if they're just taking more land and strapping our hands behind our back more.

Actually what I want to add is the point that there are only 10 communities in the country, the entire country, that are distressed in the manner we are by federal and state occupancy of land. We are isolated, surrounded and we are crammed.

So we're not just another place in Orange County or New York State in terms of considering how to apply these laws, just it needs to be for the community, not just the businesses.

And I want to give three examples if they are going to consider, there are families here that have two or three jobs, one family people working two to three jobs to try to, to exist here.

One family left in the middle of the school year last year, two children in our

1	Church Hill Properties 61
2	schools. It was in the spring, they couldn't
3	even afford to finish out the school year and
4	left here.
5	And then the data on our income is
6	somewhat skewed because you have, there are a
7	lot of retired military people who have
8	earned every penny of retirement pay and now
9	they are successfully doing second jobs which
10	puts them at a higher income bracket.
11	So if you just look at data and look
12	at oh, okay these guys are doing okay, those
13	are extra considerations.
14	MR. DOWD: Thank you, ma'am.
15	Mr. DiSalvo.
16	MR. DiSALVO: Just a comment on the
17	whole thing because some of the things I'm
18	hearing in this room kind of perplex me a
19	little bit.
20	You know, 96 percent of our land, we
21	got it. We're a unique community, one of 10
22	maybe in the country, got it, which is all
23	the more reason why you have a tool like the
24	IDA that tries to attract a 40 million, 30

million-dollar project to build here.

25

\_

Now, what do they provide for that?

They provide jobs, potentially 120, they provide tax payment. And in this case because of the project they are not adding any costs or as much cost to a school system or to the village.

You'll probably have an additional cost maybe for fire, if West Point gets rid of their ladder truck, which I highly doubt. And maybe cost to an ambulance call, God forbid. But let's try not, don't lose, I think Chairman Brescia from the Legislature, always says don't miss the forest through the trees.

Like it's a project that we don't, we don't normally see here and I have concerns, I have concerns, I've mentioned them to my other IDA members. And by the way, you guys are lucky in the fact that I'm on the IDA.

I'm not going to let anything in my power happen to this community. I live here. You live around the corner, my father lives right around the corner from — up the hill from Mr. McCarthy. We are not going to vote on

something that's not going to be a long term benefit to this community. I'll never vote, I'll scream at the top of my head, I'll resign from the board. These people know me. So don't, it can't be looked at as a cash grab. And for lack of a better term we are going to hold these folks accountable, if they don't know it, I hope they know it today, but you know like don't, it's not a cash grab. They are going to pay taxes. They are going to add little cost to the community up front.

Those areas where they are going to add cost, water and sewer, they are going to pay full freight. They are going to pay full freight for the ambulance corps, that doesn't go away. They're not in the fire district, they are in the Village of Highland Falls, so we are going to get tax money for that.

And, by the way, they are taking a piece of property and after year 10 when they pay full amount they are going to be sending us a check three times a year, one to the school, one to the town and one to the

1	Church Hill Properties 64
2	village. That's how they alleviate the
3	homeowners from paying, by not adding an
4	additional cost.
5	If it was 150 homes up there you have
6	a cost to the community. There's a huge
7	expense because I have to monitor that with
8	police, and I have an expense to plow it and
9	I have expense to maintain the roads and
10	pave.
11	And I don't mean I'm not yelling,
12	I'm not scolding, just it's a process and I
13	guaranty you, it was already mentioned by the
14	IDA once from another member, financing is a
15	huge deal for this. And I don't know how far
16	it moves if they don't have something in
17	place and we're going to scrutinize, I'm
18	going to scrutinize that at least on my end,
19	so you guys know that in the open.
20	So please, you know, don't think of it
21	as a cash grab. We are going to hold them
22	accountable, we have to. So please keep that
23	in mind.

 ${\tt MR.}$  DOWD: Are there any other

24

25

questions?

1	Church Hill Properties 65	
2	Mr. Kopald.	
3	MR. KOPALD: Could you identify the	
4	actual owners and the principals involved in	1
5	this project?	
6	MR. FRANKEL: That's all disclosed in	1
7	the application.	
8	MR. DOWD: It's part of our	
9	application, Mr. Kopald. If you need to see	ž
10	that again we would be happy to present it t	0.
11	you. It's also available online.	
12	MR. KOPALD: Okay, thank you.	
13	MR. DOWD: Any other questions?	
14	There being no further questions	
15	I'm going to declare the public hearing	
16	closed.	
17	But for the benefit of Mr. Kopald we	
18	will entertain written comments to the IDA r	10
19	later than close of business Monday July	
20	16th. So if you have anyone who wants to	
21	send us a letter we would be very happy to	
22	accept them until 5 o'clock on July 16th.	
23	Thank you very much.	
24	MR. DiSALVO: I can extend that	
25	further, if you have any concerns you can	

1	Church Hill Properties 66
2	e-mail me, I will give you my e-mail.
3	(The hearing was closed at 12:14 p.m.)
4	* * *
5	
6	
7	THE FOREGOING IS CERTIFIED
8	to be a true and correct transcription of the
9	original stenographic minutes to the best of my
10	ability.
11	$Q_{+}$ . $\Omega$
12	Roberta O'Rourke, Court Stenographer
13	Roberta O Rourke, Court Stemographer
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	